



Maricopa County Sheriff's Office

Paul Penzone, Sheriff
550 W. Jackson St.
Phoenix, AZ 85003
(602) 876-1000

The 8th Traffic Stop annual Report (TSAR) was released on June 30, 2023. Although this report continues to reflect some disparities in various traffic stop outcomes, I am pleased that the report does not show significant increases in the disparities in 2022, and in fact shows reductions in most areas. This study did not show statistically significant differences in arrests and seizures across all races nor any statistically significant differences in citations or searches among Blacks and a combined group of all minorities. Hispanics were subjected to searches at a higher rate than white drivers and were 3.68% more likely to receive a citation than white drivers. Hispanics, Blacks and a combined group of all minorities still show disparities in stop length. The disparity for Hispanic stop length, however, has been cut in half from last year. In plain language, the report found that Hispanics were stopped approximately 29 seconds longer than whites, Blacks were stopped approximately 43 seconds longer, and a combined group of all minorities were stopped approximately 50 seconds longer.

The continued disparities in these areas are concerning and require additional review to determine the cause, which may include systemic bias in our patrol function. During the past year, we have done much in an effort to determine the causes of these disparities so that they can be addressed. As part of that effort, MCSO published four quarterly reports since the last TSAR.

- TSQR 7 (June 2022) which reviewed arrest activity. As a result of this report, MCSO determined further analysis was needed and developed two quarterly reports - one assessing the effect of special assignments on disparities which was published in December 2022 and one looking at search data published in March 2023. MCSO also adjusted our Vehicle Stop Contact Form (VSCF) to ensure more accurate data collection.
- TSQR 8 (September 2022) which reviewed disparities over time. This report included an overview of some of the ongoing activities aimed at identifying or reducing disparities. The results of this study showed that some disparities were reduced over time and some increased but, it is likely the most impactful efforts to reduce disparities were implemented prior to the initial comparable data available for the study.
- TSQR 9 (December 2022) which reviewed the effect special assignments had on disparities and traffic stop data. Recommendations completed include:
 - A special assignment variable was added to the VSCF to more accurately track special assignment stops.

-
- A Low Stop Quarterly Report was proposed and will be published on June 30th 2023.
 - TSQR 10 (March 2023) reviewed data regarding searches. As a result of this quarterly, our traffic stop researchers have made several suggested changes to the Vehicle Stop Contact Form (VSCF) to allow for better data collection which in turn would allow for a more concentrated effort to determine the cause of any disparities identified in the future. Additionally, the group recommended that a working group convene to determine if any policy provisions are driving the disparities and recommend changes to that policy. This committee met in April 2023 and reviewed the entire Search policy. The committee recommended no modifications to the policy, but did determine modifications to the VSCF would help mitigate the coding errors found during the study.

We continue to provide extensive training related to constitutional, bias-free policing throughout the year for all sworn personnel. We are currently in the process of restructuring some of that training to focus directly on the information gained from the TSAR each year to help reduce disparities. Some of this training requires a discussion between patrol deputies and their supervisors and is a good opportunity for growth. We also have a large library of trainings related to cultural competency focused directly on the areas we patrol. As every year, our supervisor annual training (SRELE) trains supervisors to look for patterns or indicia of possible bias and deputies (and all personnel) receive semi-annual reminders of our CP-8 policy regarding biased based activity.

Our Community Outreach team continues to be heavily involved in several areas of our community and have spent a significant amount of time and resources working with Hispanic youth in Guadalupe and at Franklin Police and Fire High School. They work with community groups and have reach out efforts with the Mexican and Guatemalan consulates. Our Public Information group developed a social media presentation regarding the importance of what documentation is needed during a traffic stop and has plans to run the campaign 2-3 times each year as a reminder of the need to have a valid driver's license, registration, and insurance while on the roadways of Maricopa County.

Finally, I am especially heartened by the continued implementation of the Traffic Stop Monthly Reports (TSMR) which analyzes traffic stop data each month to look for warning signs or indicia of possible biased-based policing and/or racial/ethnic profiling by individual deputies. The monthly analysis compares deputy traffic stops using a rolling twelve-month period. This process allows for early identification, monitoring, and intervention with individual deputies when appropriate. None of the deputies who have received interventions as a result of this process, were found to be racially profiling individuals nor has the team found any explicit bias as a result of these reviews. Most interventions are a result of disparities in citation rates or stop length which TSAU has not found to be caused by explicit racial bias.

I am proud of the job MCSO continues to do to reduce disparities in our patrol function. I believe we have one of the most robust traffic stop data collection systems in the country that allows us to determine where disparities exist and to attempt to determine the causes of those disparities. I also believe we are a leader in the country's law enforcement community in addressing these disparities. The fact that the TSMRs have not found any racial profiling or explicit racial bias suggests that these disparities are driven by implicit bias, race-neutral factors or factors outside our control (state laws, street and highway design, etc.) We will continue to address implicit bias and other factors within our control through training, traffic studies, audits and inspections, and community engagement. I remain encouraged by findings in the latest traffic report but continue to be attentive to areas of disparity. As we continue toward full compliance of the Court's orders, we will continue to work with the Court, the Monitor, the parties and the community on the best ways to reduce the disparities found in TSAR 8. I remain committed to ethical constitutional policing practices as Maricopa County Sheriff.