

TSAR 9 Reanalysis Addendum

At the request of the Monitoring Team during the April 21-23, 2026, site visit, MCSO has reanalyzed TSAR 8 (data year 2022) and TSAR 9 (data year 2023) data which utilized the arrest variable in the propensity score matching process for stop length or as an outcome variable. The impetus for this reanalysis was a 2024 data entry error identified by MCSO during the development of TSQR 20 in the fourth quarter of 2025. MCSO identified and released information about the error in 2025, explained the error, corrected these entries prior to the TSQR 19 analysis of arrest patterns, and used the corrected data to reanalyze TSAR 10 data on stop length and arrests, which had already been released. MCSO has worked diligently with the Monitoring Team and Parties to process and analyze MCSO's traffic stop data, collaborated on methodologies and produced several documents over the years that looked at the data in its original form. MCSO believes that it is important to note that this reanalysis of past data, while requested by the Monitoring Team, was the result of MCSO recognizing the error in the first place. MCSO wants to show the community our transparency and commitment to getting the data right and our accountability when we find an error. This document identifies changes to results in the TSAR 9 analysis when accounting for the additional arrests.

To reanalyze the data MCSO utilized the same methods that were used with the arrest and stop length analyses that were employed for TSAR 9. The only change in the analysis was the identification and inclusion of an additional N = 135 arrests in 2023. In 2023, this was an error rate in TSAR 9 data of 0.72 percent.

For arrests effectuated in 2023, but mis-labeled in the VSCF forms, two were for DUIs (N = 2), failure to stop or provide driver license or evidence of identity (ARS 28-1595; N = 3), driving on a suspended license, (ARS 28-3473A; N = 54), criminal speed (ARS 28-701.02; N = 66), unlawful use of license (ARS 28-3478; N = 1), reckless driving (ARS 28-695; N = 6), one underage DUI (ARS 4-244.34; N = 1), and two warrant arrests (N = 2).

Biased-free policing, as defined by the Monitoring Team, "means that race or Latino ancestry is not a factor in any law enforcement decisions except where allowed by law." An unequal distribution of traffic stop outcomes, as analyzed in this report, may result from a range of external factors outside of individual deputies' control or MCSO policies or practice. Statistical differences in traffic stop outcomes or stop length should not be interpreted as evidence of discriminatory policing, absent additional evidence demonstrating differential law enforcement action in practice or policy. Per Paragraphs 53, 64, 67, and 69 of the Supplemental Permanent Injunction, inequality identified by analyses conducted by MCSO are "indicia of possible racial profiling." Per Paragraph 70 of the Supplemental Injunction, MCSO investigates the findings from these analyses and will take appropriate action if racial profiling exists. Since MCSO began conducting the TSMR analyses in 2021, neither MCSO nor the Monitor's team or parties (the DOJ and ACLU) have identified individuals, policy or practice as racial profiling.

Using the refined 2023 arrest data, MCSO conducted a total of 30 additional propensity score matching and regression analyses and compared results to the results reported in TSAR 9. Of the 30 models, we identified 2 changes to results in TSAR 9 findings. In both cases, differences that were previously identified as statistically significant in TSAR 9 were no longer statistically significant.

1. The PSM baseline stop length analysis in TSAR 9 (excludes extended stops) reported a statistically significant difference in stop length between Minority and White drivers. After reanalysis this difference was no longer statistically significant.
2. The PSM analysis of booked arrests (compared to all other stops) in TSAR 9 reported a statistically significant difference between Minority and White drivers. After reanalysis, the difference in booked arrest rates between Minority and White drivers was no longer statistically significant.

PSM, Stop Length Analysis, Baseline Analysis, Extended Stops Removed

TSAR 9 Data	Difference (in minutes)	t-statistic	Statistically significant?
Hispanic v. White Drivers	0.33	1.71	No
Black v. White Drivers	0.46	1.79	No
Minority v. White Drivers	0.28	2.06	Yes

PSM, Stop Length Analysis, Baseline Analysis, Extended Stops Removed

Revised TSAR 9 Data	Difference (in minutes)	t-statistic	Statistically significant?
Hispanic v. White Drivers	0.25	1.17	No
Black v. White Drivers	0.20	0.76	No
Minority v. White Drivers	0.25	1.79	No

PSM, Stop Length Analysis, Including Special Assignments as a Matching Variable, Extended Stops Removed

TSAR 9 Data	Difference (in minutes)	t-statistic	Statistically significant?
Hispanic v. White Drivers	0.26	1.51	No
Black v. White Drivers	0.30	1.18	No
Minority v. White Drivers	0.29	1.73	No

PSM, Stop Length Analysis, Including Special Assignments as a Matching Variable, Extended Stops Removed

Revised TSAR 9 Data	Difference (in minutes)	t-statistic	Statistically significant?
Hispanic v. White Drivers	0.30	1.47	No
Black v. White Drivers	0.28	1.11	No
Minority v. White Drivers	0.26	1.73	No

PSM, Stop Length Analysis, All Stops

TSAR 9 Data	Difference (in minutes)	t-statistic	Statistically significant?
Hispanic v. White Drivers	1.73	1.79	No
Black v. White Drivers	1.42	1.35	No
Minority v. White Drivers	0.80	1.00	No

PSM, Stop Length Analysis, All Stops

Revised TSAR 9 Data	Difference (in minutes)	t-statistic	Statistically significant?
Hispanic v. White Drivers	1.14	1.27	No
Black v. White Drivers	-0.18	-0.16	No
Minority v. White Drivers	1.41	1.66	No

Regression, Stop Length Analysis, Controlling for Extended Stops

TSAR 9 Data	Difference (in minutes)	t-statistic	Statistically significant?
Hispanic v. White Drivers	0.52	1.08	No
Black v. White Drivers	1.04	1.44	No
Minority v. White Drivers	0.57	1.54	No

Regression, Stop Length Analysis, Controlling for Extended Stops

Revised TSAR 9 Data	Difference (in minutes)	t-statistic	Statistically significant?
Hispanic v. White Drivers	0.39	0.81	No
Black v. White Drivers	1.00	1.39	No
Minority v. White Drivers	0.51	1.39	No

PSM, Stop Length Analysis, Extended Stops as Matching Variables

TSAR 9 Data	Difference (in minutes)	t-statistic	Statistically significant?
Hispanic v. White Drivers	0.03	0.02	No
Black v. White Drivers	0.22	0.21	No
Minority v. White Drivers	0.68	0.99	No

PSM, Stop Length Analysis, Extended Stops as Matching Variables

Revised TSAR 9 Data	Difference (in minutes)	t-statistic	Statistically significant?
Hispanic v. White Drivers	0.01	0.01	No
Black v. White Drivers	1.48	1.36	No
Minority v. White Drivers	0.43	0.52	No

PSM, Arrests, Baseline Analysis

TSAR 9 Data	Difference (in percent)	t-statistic	Statistically significant?
Hispanic v. White Drivers	0.91	1.31	No
Black v. White Drivers	1.54	1.49	No
Minority v. White Drivers	0.58	1.02	No

PSM, Arrests, Baseline Analysis

Revised TSAR 9 Data	Difference (in percent)	t-statistic	Statistically significant?
Hispanic v. White Drivers	0.95	1.27	No
Black v. White Drivers	0.10	0.93	No
Minority v. White Drivers	0.95	1.55	No

PSM, Booked Arrests, Compared to all Other Stops

TSAR 9 Data	Difference (in percent)	t-statistic	Statistically significant?
Hispanic v. White Drivers	0.42	1.68	No
Black v. White Drivers	0.19	0.66	No
Minority v. White Drivers	0.40	2.78	Yes

Booked Arrests, Compared to all Other Stops

Revised TSAR 9 Data	Difference (in percent)	t-statistic	Statistically significant?
Hispanic v. White Drivers	0.42	1.68	No
Black v. White Drivers	0.19	0.66	No
Minority v. White Drivers	0.22	1.80	No

PSM, Non-Warrant Arrests, Compared to all Other Stops

TSAR 9 Data	Difference (in percent)	t-statistic	Statistically significant?
Hispanic v. White Drivers	-0.26	-0.40	No
Black v. White Drivers	0.71	0.71	No
Minority v. White Drivers	-0.20	-0.34	No

PSM, Non-Warrant Arrests, Compared to all Other Stops

Revised TSAR 9 Data	Difference (in percent)	t-statistic	Statistically significant?
Hispanic v. White Drivers	0.02	0.03	No
Black v. White Drivers	0.71	0.67	No
Minority v. White Drivers	-0.19	-0.29	No

PSM, Arrests, Including Special Assignments as Matching Variables

TSAR 8 Data	Difference (in percent)	t-statistic	Statistically significant?
Hispanic v. White Drivers	0.02	0.03	No
Black v. White Drivers	0.64	0.63	No
Minority v. White Drivers	0.64	1.05	No

Arrests, Including Special Assignments as Matching Variables

Revised TSAR 8 Data	Difference (in percent)	t-statistic	Statistically significant?
Hispanic v. White Drivers	-0.09	-0.11	No
Black v. White Drivers	-0.71	-0.62	No
Minority v. White Drivers	0.55	0.86	No

PSM, Booked Arrests, Compared to Cite and Release Arrests

TSAR 9 Data	Difference (in percent)	t-statistic	Statistically significant?
Hispanic v. White Drivers	0.29	0.06	No
Black v. White Drivers	0.00	0.00	No
Minority v. White Drivers	-3.71	-0.97	No

PSM, Booked Arrests, Compared to Cite and Release Arrests

Revised TSAR 9 Data	Difference (in percent)	t-statistic	Statistically significant?
Hispanic v. White Drivers	-0.25	-0.08	No
Black v. White Drivers	0.00	0.00	No
Minority v. White Drivers	-0.52	-0.24	No